MEMORANDUM

TO: ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

FROM: ANDREW PEREZ, ASSISTANT PLANNER

SUBJECT: CONSIDERATION OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW 19-006; EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS TO AN EXISTING NONRESIDENTIAL STRUCTURE; LOCATION – 127 BRIDGE STREET; APPLICANT – BLAIR MANKINS; REPRESENTATIVE – KYLE HARRIS, HARRIS ARCHITECTURE AND DESIGN

DATE: JANUARY 6, 2020

SUMMARY OF ACTION:
Recommendation of approval to the Community Development Director will allow for alterations to the existing commercial structure.

IMPACT ON FINANCIAL AND PERSONNEL RESOURCES:
None.

RECOMMENDATION:
It is recommended the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) review the proposed project and make a recommendation to the Community Development Director.

BACKGROUND:
The subject property is zoned Public Facility (PF), and is located in the D-2.4 Historic Character Overlay District (Attachment 1). It’s location in the Historic Character Overlay District requires review by the ARC for compliance with the Design Guidelines and Standards for the Historic Character Overlay District (Design Guidelines) (Attachment 2) because the project proposes exterior alterations to a commercial structure in the Village Downtown Core.

ANALYSIS OF ISSUES:
Project Description
Existing development on the 31,800 square foot site consists of a one-story 1,450 square foot commercial building at the front of the property and an unstriped parking lot behind. The subject property is located across the street from the historic I.O.O.F Hall, which is on the National Register of Historic Places and currently is home to the South County Historical Society.

The existing building’s design is simple and its most prominent feature are the four large tinted windows above the brick wainscot on the front facade. An array of five (5)
identically sized windows are located on the northern elevation along with a HVAC condenser, conduit, and utility meters. A brick half-wall in the same style as the brick wainscot encloses the recessed entry area along the northern elevation. Wood panel siding is used on all four sides of the building and a flat roof covers the top of the structure. The siding is painted a light gray and the trim and fascia are painted blue.

The project proposes to renovate the structure by replacing all of the exterior siding and change the flat roof to a pitched roof. All of the windows would also be replaced with new, white, vinyl windows and the storefront entry would be anodized aluminum. The project also proposes to repave the driveway and parking lot, and restripe the parking stalls to include ADA parking facilities.

The existing wood panel siding would be replaced with horizontal hardie panel siding above a 36” stone wainscot that wraps the entire building. The project also proposes to trim each of the buildings corners with hardie plank as well. New roof trusses are proposed to be installed on the existing roof structure to create a pitched roof, and a new standing seam metal roof is proposed. Fishscale shingles would be added to the gable ends on both the front and rear elevations. The walls and gable shingles are proposed to be painted a warm yellow color and the trim, fascia, and corners would be painted a dark green color. The metal roof is also proposed to be dark green, similar to the trim and fascia (Attachment 3). The applicant is proposing a stone wainscot that would be similar to the yellow sandstone found on the I.O.O.F. Hall, however an exact product has yet to be found. Color and material samples will be available to the Committee at the meeting.

**Design Guidelines**

The proposed hardie plank siding simulates the appearance of wood siding as encouraged by the Design Guidelines and utilized by multiple other buildings on this block of Bridge Street. The Design Guidelines state that “new or replacement door frames and window sashes should be made of wood or an approved substitute material that approximates the appearance of original materials”. The project proposes vinyl windows and aluminum for the new storefront entry that simulate the original materials used in the construction of this building.

The proposal also includes the construction of a pitched roof structure and metal seam roofing material. The Design Guidelines encourage composition shingles or other nonflammable material that simulates the appearance of wood. Flat roofs are quite common in the Village, but those structures with pitched roofs usually use composition shingles, and to a lesser extent wood shingles, as the roofing material. However, there are at least two other instances of metal roofs in the Village: the mixed-use building located at 151 W. Branch Street and at the Village Centre commercial complex located at 130 W. Branch Street. The building at 151 W. Branch Street uses metal roofing on the roof eyebrows, and metal roofing is used on the tower elements at the Village Centre complex. A recommendation from the ARC on whether the roofing material and use of vinyl windows and aluminum is appropriate with regards to the Design Guidelines
is requested. It should be noted that the architectural style of this building is considerably different from those commonly found in the Village. The building is mostly original from when it was constructed in 1962, and has never utilized the construction materials that the Design Guidelines promote. This distinction should be taken into consideration in the Committee's review of this proposal.

Building colors in the Village Mixed-Use are encouraged to be tones that match the natural environment and compatible with nearby buildings, both of which would be accomplished with the proposed color palette.

ADVANTAGES:
The project satisfies the requirements of both the Arroyo Grande Municipal Code and the Design Guidelines. Additionally, the project will greatly improve the appearance of an existing building in the Historic Overlay District.

DISADVANTAGES:
The project proposes to use construction materials that are in conflict with the Design Guidelines, but are comparable to the originals.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:
The project was reviewed in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and determined to be categorically exempt per Section 15301(a) of the Guidelines regarding minor exterior alterations to existing structures.

PUBLIC NOTIFICATION AND COMMENTS:
The Agenda was posted at City Hall and on the City’s website in accordance with Government Code Section 54954.2.

ATTACHMENTS:
1. Project Location and Existing Façade
2. Design Guidelines P. 32-35
3. Proposed Colors
4. Project Plans
Village Mixed Use (VMU)

This section of the Guidelines and Standards applies to areas between the Village Core Downtown and the Village Residential districts surrounding the Village, as shown on the Design Overlay map including the Public Facilities district. The Village Mixed Use district is intended to provide space for intensified mixed use projects compatible with adjoining commercial or residential districts. The Guidelines and Standards for this area are intended to enhance these transitional areas.

An objective of the Village Mixed Use district is to maintain and develop mixed uses in a manner that allows a transition from the intense commercial character of the Village Core Downtown to the surrounding traditional Village Residential neighborhoods. Adaptive re-use of existing houses is encouraged to accommodate new uses while maintaining the historical residential heritage. The Village Mixed Use district should enhance pedestrian accessibility and activity and minimize the visual impact of automobiles.

EXISTING CHARACTER

The Village Mixed Use districts contain a combination of commercial, office and residential uses rather than exclusively residential or commercial character evident in adjoining areas. Generally, the character of existing development reflects the period of the late 19th Century, however, it derives its diversity from the combination of residential and commercial uses over time.

Diversity in Scale

Many of the buildings surrounding the Village Core Downtown are small residential structures that are being used as homes, offices, or small retail stores. The lot sizes and building types are more consistent with Village Residential areas. Most of the buildings are one story, however, some two story homes and offices exist proximate to the Village Core Downtown. Generally, the scale of the Village Mixed Use neighborhood is smaller with moderate sized separated buildings.

Similarity of Material

Building materials used in the Village Mixed Use district generally reflect those used in Village Residential neighborhoods rather than Village Core Downtown commercial buildings. The most common cladding material is either weatherboard or clapboard wood siding. Other popular materials include stucco or plaster, and shingles of various designs are often seen as accent materials or ornamentation, especially on gable ends. The most common roofing material is composition shingle, and
to a lesser extent wood shingle. Yellow indigenous sandstone, which is a distinct building material in the Village Core Downtown, is not as common for Village Residential and Village Mixed Use buildings, but it is sometimes used as a foundation material or a trim material along with stone or brick. Window frames are almost exclusively wood, and door materials incorporate wood panels with glass, in varying proportions.

**Sense of Experimentation**

Most Village Mixed Use districts exhibit a Village Residential rather than Village Core Downtown commercial character. Use of similar building materials, colors, or styles with individual building design or unique ornamentation brings out a more eclectic nature within Village Mixed Use districts. Such diversity is encouraged.

**Variety in Building Form**

Buildings are single and two-story with varying architectural styles and sizes. Varying setbacks and distinct wing arrangements create a unique streetscape. Landscaping adds character by screening and accenting the buildings in the Village Mixed Use district. Variety in building form is due to historic mixed uses and diversity of individual infill developments between the Village Core Downtown and Village Residential areas over time. Materials and building styles incorporate details from both residential and commercial building types.

**DESIGN GUIDELINES AND STANDARDS**

The following building elements shall NEITHER overpower the project or detract from the visual continuity of the streetscape or neighborhood NOR produce redundancy in feature or pattern that is discordant with the historic character of the district:

- Building scale
- Building form
- Building façade
- Building entrance
- Roofline
- Fencing, rails or trellis
- Archways, columns or towers
- Doors and windows
- Signage or feature designed for sign placement
- Colors

**Site Design**

All new projects or substantial alterations and additions are required to adhere to site development standards of the Development Code.

Front Setbacks in the Village Mixed Use district should be in line with traditional houses along the block generally ten to twenty feet (10’ - 20’). Where setbacks vary, a new building shall fit within the range of setbacks of the block.
When a structure is built in or altered in or is facing a predominantly residential block, it should take on a residential design character regardless of its proposed use.

For a Village Mixed Use district project that is predominantly residential in use, the design of the project should reflect a residential character.

Residential and mixed use buildings in the Village Mixed Use district shall comply with the design standards for the Village Mixed Use district, unless otherwise approved by the ARC and Planning Commission. Exceptions may include retail commercial uses in close proximity to the Village Core Downtown.

Connective elements such as walkways, common landscaped areas, building orientation, and unfenced property lines are encouraged.

Particular care should be taken to assure convenient pedestrian and bike circulation through all parts of a project and to adjoining properties in the Village Mixed Use district.

Any surface parking should be provided in well-screened parking lots at the rear or sides of projects. Parking that is intended to support commercial or office uses should be placed in convenient proximity to such uses. At least one on-site parking space shall be provided for each dwelling unit, regardless of dwelling size.

New outbuildings, including garages and enclosures for service areas, trash or recycle containers, or storage structure should be compatible with materials, textures and colors of the principal buildings. Projects that propose potential newspaper racks shall include a designated area consistent with the building architecture. Vending machines in public view shall be placed within an enclosing structure. Plans for the structure shall be subject to ARC approval.

Existing trees should be retained where possible. A Tree Removal Permit may be required (Municipal Code 12.16). Judicious pruning and shaping will be allowed. Street trees and other sidewalk area landscaping shall be incorporated if pedestrian circulation will not be obstructed. (Streetscape improvements within the public right-of-way require an Encroachment Permit from the Public Works Department.) Front yards should be landscaped compatible with the majority of neighboring properties and maintained on a regular basis. Each residential unit shall provide a private outdoor patio, courtyard, atrium or balconies, regardless of unit size.

Street furniture and fixtures shall complement the existing sidewalk paving, lighting schemes, and street furniture within the Village Core Downtown.

A site plan incorporating the project within adjacent development shall be submitted as part of the application for Architectural Review.

Building Design

The height of new buildings shall not exceed Development Code standards: generally one and two stories are allowed. New building additions and alterations should be compatible with the adjoining area and not exceed height, lot coverage and floor area ratio requirements of the Development Code.

The use of consistent architectural styles from the years 1870 to 1940 is strongly encouraged rather than additions or alterations from more recent or different design styles (see Architectural Styles for examples).

New construction should include elements such as cladding, roofing material, roof structure and ornamentation common to the district.
The existing pattern of building facades generally respecting pedestrian or human scale design should be incorporated into new development projects. Façade designs that incorporate either brick or stone elements and parapets are appropriate for commercial structures. Roof types generally associated with residential buildings such as gable, hip or gambrel are also appropriate for structures within the Village Mixed Use district.

A building front should provide visual interest and a sense of human scale.

All decorative fixtures, including awnings, signs and lighting, shall be integrated with other design elements of the structures.

Building elevations shall be submitted as part of the application for ARC review. Perspectives, accurate sections or a model of the project may be required to depict the height, mass and scale of the proposed project with respect to its setting and adjacent development.

Construction Materials

Clapboard, weatherboard cladding, and cement plaster, including stucco, are building materials used in the Village Mixed Use district. Cement plaster is most prevalent in more recent designs and on Spanish Eclectic style buildings. All cladding or wood materials should be painted or treated to preserve the wood, and to give the structure a more finished look. New roofing materials should incorporate composition shingles or other nonflammable material that simulates the appearance of wood. For Spanish Eclectic or Pueblo styles, the use of mission tiles is appropriate.

New or replacement door frames and window sashes should be made of wood or an approved substitute material that approximates the appearance of original materials.

Some existing buildings incorporate materials that do not reflect historic styles such as synthetic siding, concrete block and aluminum, which are the result of prior additions or remodels. Further use of these materials is not permitted unless necessary for minor changes to elevations already composed of such elements. Additions or alterations to buildings shall use the original building materials where possible, or approved materials that simulate original materials.

Original decorative details should be retained where possible. If original historic materials have deteriorated and must be removed, they shall be replaced with materials that match the original design, color and texture.

Sample materials shall be submitted as part of the application for ARC review.

Building Colors

Building colors should be compatible with the historic character of the area, and should not conflict with other colors in the surrounding areas. The building colors in the historic districts primarily include tones that match the natural environment such as earth tones. Some Victorian homes in the Village Residential and Village Mixed Use portions of the Village use brighter colors to accent the style of these buildings.

Neon or day-glow colors are not appropriate. Bright colors, such as those on the Victorian homes, shall be limited to accent details or portions of the buildings. Color samples shall be submitted as part of the application for ARC review.
Walls and gable shingles

SW 6666
Enjoyable Yellow
Interior
Locator Number: 132-C1

Trim & fascia

SW 6468
Hunt Club
Interior / Exterior
Locator Number: 160-C7

Roof

HUNTER GREEN